

'Vision for Cape Town' – Tony Ehrenreich and Patricia De Lille Wolpe 16 August 2011

Questions

- 1) Question for Mayor De Lille. You said that R1.2 billion was spent on the poor. But how much was spent on the 'not poor'?
- 2) We hear people concerned about the benefit for all. Why cant we learn to work together to integrate all the policies that people are working towards?
- 3) We often hear that Cape Town is a group of 5 villages clumped together pretending to be a city. What proposals are there to create one city, to bridge these gaps?
- 4) It is interesting to be sitting here in Cape Town with two people of such high caliber sitting here in our local government. Patricia De Lille is someone who we have seen in different incarnations in the past few years and I must say that it was a disappointment to see Tony sink to the level of becoming a politician. My question is, out of their visions for the future, is it possible for these two people to work together for the benefit for all of the people in this city, taking into account that they cannot solve all of the problems of the country?
- 5) I want to talk about the under-spending of the budget. This is a major concern for me as a taxpayer. If you look across the Metro, you will see the poverty that is so rife here. The question I want to pose is to the mayor is what is going to the money that it did not use in the coming financial year? Can they use it in the new financial year to bring about change?
- 6) I want to raise two issues. What should happen is that we should focus our attention on food security. A recent UCT study found that 80% of our homes in Cape Town are food insecure. On the one hand is that we are spending a lot of money in rich areas but on the Cape Flats, where I come from, we have been asking for a road that is as important for us as the M3 and M5 is for the rest of Cape Town. But this issue has been ignored for 30 years. It is about time that we built this road. A city planner said to me that if we built this road today, it would be running at full stretch within a week.

Mayor De Lille

Are you talking about the R300 road? ['yes' from the crowd].

Let me start with the issue of working together. From the outset, I never said that we would have a monopoly on what is good and what is bad for Cape Town. I have invited all parties at council level to come forward with ideas and engage properly. I also know that the role of the opposition is to hold us to account, and they must play that role. I did have a meeting with Tony already where we have exchanged ideas and we have endeavored to work along those lines. I have said to him that wherever he finds problems with city officials, he must please be in touch with me, and like any other councilor, he can call me anytime, and then we can unblock those blockages. From the DA's side, we are ready and willing to work with anyone who has the best interests of the city at heart and want the city to succeed.

The under-spending of the budget was the capital budget. But we just released a report today on the operational budget. And the operational budget is much bigger than the capital budget and we have spent 90% of the operational budget. I have put special measures in place to make sure that we monitor on a monthly basis our spending in the city. I have given to all mayoral committee members this responsibility of monthly so that they monitor the service delivery implementation plan to make sure that they are spending the money. So we hope to avoid this problem in the future.

We spent R1.2 billion on the poor. And what do we spend on the rich? The rich cross subsidise the poor people in Cape Town. But we don't want to look as if we are taking from the rich to give to the poor because we are one city and we want to build a caring city. I am amazed at the simplicity with which we want to change our country within 17 years, and I am talking about on a national level. I am amazed at the short memory that people have about our history of 350 years of colonialism and apartheid. The spatial development in this country brought about the Mitchells Plains, the Khayalitshas and the Constantias. It is only a fool that thinks we can change this in 17 years given apartheid's spatial development. Remember, the Free State was an Indian-free area, the Western Cape was a Colored preferential area. For those who have not studied our history, let me give you a bit of history. This is our history.

The South African National Defence Force is sitting on acres of land on the N1 in Landsdowne road. We are trying to buy that land from the Defence Force so that we can build integrated communities and bring people closer to the work place. What happens? The Minister and the SANDF refused. We even offered the SANDF other land but they are not working with us. This is why it is so important for the different levels of government to work together.

The issue of food security. I want to agree with you. This is the key. And when I look at climate change and the environment and the rain patterns - for this winter we have had hardly had any rain. A food security plan must be there by the national, provincial and local government to look after our people so that we can do our bit.

I want to share one statistic with you. The Western Cape has just added 1500 extra school teachers to the value of R367 million to poor schools in the Western Cape. So we do care. A lot of parents are moving to the Western Cape to put their children in better schools. We welcome these children with open arms. We are not complaining that people are coming into the Western Cape but people must know that the target is shifting all the time due to the numbers of people who are coming here.

The other statistic that I want to share with you is unemployment – it is 8% in the Western Cape. It is still very high, but it is the lowest in the country. Then also, the UN habitat survey that came out in 2011, found that Cape Town is the most equal city in South Africa and that Joburg and East London are Ekurhuleni are the most unequal cities in the world. You can show me any other survey but don't suck things out of your thumb and dismiss what I am saying.

Last night I was in Ilitha Park in Khayelitsha. I had a meeting there. There is one housing development that has been stuck for a year. The community told me that these houses in Ilitha Park, they are bonded houses - we have invested our savings in these houses and we are paying a lot of money for it. We do not want, as residents, any temporary TRAs or IDAs in the area, because it would bring down the values of their homes. I accepted that. Because none of us, in whatever area, would like the council to come to our area and put up temporary structures. We have to listen to the

views of the community that live there. I agreed with them. I said that we will make sure that we do not put a temporary residents structure next to Ilitha Park, so that they can also be happy. So if you really want to be masters at analyzing and criticizing, it is always good to go to where the people live, and not be arm chair politicians.

Tony Ehrenreich

Thank you for those enlightening statistics Madam Mayor.

There are a few things that we need to take account of. I do think that sometimes the comparison is less important than what it is that we have to do. There is no disputing the fact that the unemployment level in the Western Cape is 21.5%. The national unemployment level, from the Reserve Bank, is 25%. The expanded definition is 32%. The figures that the Mayor gives are surprising but we will all go back and look at our research.

But the point is that the problems are immense and we need to work together. Because the point that the gentleman made over there about me sinking to the level of politics was a good one. I think like anyone, you search your soul about becoming a politician because of what is happening in South Africa. Politics in this country is a far cry away from what we thought it would be. It used to be the idea that you were going to serve the people, not enrich yourself as a result of your party political position. Because that is what is happening across all the political parties. And that is why I said that I would not take the R1.2 million salary of a mayor, it was not directed at the mayor of Cape Town, but at all mayors in this country because there is something fundamentally wrong when we have people who are so poor and we enrich ourselves in the process. Because sure, people are entitled to a decent standard of living, but exorbitance is a huge area of concern in this country.

In the way that the City of Cape Town operates they perpetuate this culture of enrichment. We have just approved 24 sub-councils. Each of these has chairs and those chairs are generally party political appointments. Those chairs are going to earn salaries similar to the 'Makor positions', which are between R600 000 –R800 000 a year. The jobs that those sub-chairs do are minimal because the city does most of it (I know that sit on one and it only has 9 councilors). We are the only city in the country with this system. And it is just another wasteful expenditure on salaries.

I have heard that in the City of Cape Town they now want to put in remuneration for chairs of the portfolio committee. Now, here is your opportunity to hold the mayor to account. There is a big push from a lot of the politicians who come to politics, not to serve our people, but to enrich themselves. So if the mayor is going to tell us tonight that she is not going to pay those sub-council chairs, because we get a stipend for the meetings that we attend (why do they need more money?), then there will be an uproar in her party because it shows the values that it comes from. I have no doubt that if the ANC were to put a similar move in place, our guys would be screaming for the money as well. But it is not about the party, it is about the principle. We need to hold ourselves to a higher standard.

The rich areas do contribute the most to the tax base of the city. But it is not to subsidise the poor areas, it is because, as the mayor says, we want to build one city for all of us. We need to get away from this. What we have to do as a city, we need to identify the most urgent priorities.

In the area of public transport, what is the most urgent priority? If you pick up the paper everyday, you would know. People lose their lives on the trains. It is overcrowded, unreliable, it is a death trap at the best of times. It is a huge problem. It transports 56% of Cape Townians to and from work, across race and income groups. In Blaauwburg and Tableview, there is a need for transport, I would happily concede, but many of the people who live there have cars, they have Mercedes so that they can drive to town everyday. And maybe we should leave them for another year to be able to do that. Firstly, we need to address the urgent problem of the trains.

When we engage, it needs to be on meaningful things. And so I take the offer from the mayor to continue to talk about the things that actually affect our city. But when it came to systemic things on the council, like adopting the new budget for this year, at the first council meeting, which the mayor was at as well, we were forced to adopt a budget which we did not even have an opportunity to look to, despite asking for it beforehand so that we could review it and see if it corresponds to what our city needs.

But I am optimistic – if we can stick to the values that have brought us to this point, then we can achieve in this city, together. Thank you.

Questions

- 7) R1.2 billion referred to. But when we look at the scale of the problem, with over 230 informal settlements in the city, then this figure loses potency. Many of the policies that you spoke about are long term in nature and I agree with you that they need to be in place. But we are also facing a crisis of health, of sanitation, of safety and security where people are suffering and dying of preventable diseases, and I want to know what is being done to prioritise these crucial needs so that we can come to a more basic playing field. This would not necessarily be a place where we could all drive expensive cars and live in a fancy house, but at least people will have access to their basic human rights.
- 8) Both speakers have no credibility because while they have dreams they have no vision. The reason why I am saying this is that the main problem is the mass migration of people into this city. There are 50 000 people who are coming here every year, at least, and that means we will never be able to build sufficient housing. Never mind that Mr Ehrenreich wants to move them to Constantia and Bishopscourt. That will only work for 5 minutes and then there will be a mass of people following them. The more housing we build, the more people will come here. How do the speakers intend on addressing this mass migration? I was in China for a number of years, and there, people cannot move into Shanghai and set up a shack. They have rules that you can only come into the city if you have a job and a place to stay. Yet here, we allow people to come to the city, from all over Africa, willy-nilly and as long as it continues [uproar amongst the crowd].
- 9) I want to read that line 'to foster critical dialogue'. I want to know what amount is spent on the rich people. You said that Cape Town receives 50 000 people a year. What incentives are you putting in place are engaged in urbanization because they want better opportunities, this is their land too. Where is this R1.2 billion being spent? I was reading an article today about the strike and cleaners. I wanted to quote the deputy mayor who said that 'accept the right to strike for higher wages. I will give the memorandum to the mayor and you will receive a

considered response.' I don't know what is a high wage if R3000 is a high wage, then I don't know what planet you are coming from.

- 10) My question is to ask what your vision is for healthcare in the City of Cape Town. Primary Health Care is provided for by local government and the province. Initially we were told that these services would amalgamate in 1997 but this has not happened and it is detrimental for health in Cape Town. It is confusing for communities and elderly people want to collect their medication from a city clinic because it is not a provincial hospital and visa versa. It is also detrimental to the staff, different salary scales, staff were told that they were to be brought under one authority and this leads to de-motivation and it has been thought to lead to some of the poor health care that we see in this country. I want to know what your vision is for primary health care in Cape Town. The rest of the province has got it right, they are under one authority, but that is not the case yet in Cape Town.
- 11) I consider myself as a fool as the mayor said. We are 17 years into democracy and the moment that we have this mentality that we are still in a young democracy and we cannot do anything, then we will not be able to achieve using all of the resources that we have. But my question goes like this. Both of these speakers have not spoken about youth empowerment. Because it is the youth of this country that need to be emancipated.
- 12) I felt a pang that I have been attacked by the gentlemen who asked the question about the speakers having no credibility. I need to say this, because this is a big issue in Cape Town – racism. I just need to say this. I live in this city and I have not felt at home here since I moved into the city. What is the city going to do to address racism? Can the city please tell me about how it will assist black businesses, especially those involved in tourism? How do we build cultural bridges, from Hanover Park to Gugulethu and Camps Bay? How do we do that? How will the city assist the small businesses? How do we challenge these issues in the city?
- 13) It is a fundamental problem to say that Cape Town is an equal city when you can drive 20 minutes from the city and you get to Gugulethu and different areas where you see people are struggling every day. I think that if we say that Cape Town is an equal city, then we have set the bar very low for ourselves. I think that one way that we can deal with this inequality is education. This is the best way to change Cape Town. I know that the mayor spoke about the new teachers, but what is the city doing more than that? What is Cape Town's vision for education in Cape Town and how it will alleviate poverty in the next 5 years?
- 14) Just 2 facts to add to the discussion about education because it is very important to ground this discussion in fact. The one is Westerford High School. It got 510 As for matric out of 165 students in 2010. For the whole of Khayelitsha, out of 19 high schools, there were 44 A's out of 3228 matrics for 2010. You said that you allocated over 1500 teachers for poor schools this year. But according to the mechanism by which teachers are allocated, in 2006, only 1641 teachers were allocated to poor schools out of 32 825 teachers in the province. So if you add those two together, about 10% of teachers are being allocated to these poor high schools, like those in Khayelitsha. This is not going to fix our educational crisis. Ours is a crisis of inequality and I would like to put that to the mayor as the key obstacles for creating a new vision for Cape Town.

- 15) I want to talk about integration in Hangberg. The city bought 3 pieces of land worth tens of millions of rands. One that is filled with trees, the second that is too close to the high water mark and the third that is opposite a factory. One of last tracts of land that is available in Hout Bay – are these people too poor to live in Hout Bay? There was a big opportunity to build integrated planning but instead of doing this, they reverted back to the old apartheid planning days. My question is whether integration can also be realised for the people in Hangberg. My second one on Hangberg – while the mayor talks about public participation, a process was started in Hangberg where a new organization was formed and the city ignored residents calls for complaints unless it goes through the organization that the city created. Has the city become the 'one party city' or is it still free for all organizations to participate?
- 16) I speak for NGOs. My challenge is for Tony and Patricia – go to the NGOs to find out what they are doing. Because it is only when there are publicity stunts that politicians approach the NGOs. We are in Khayelitsha and there is a party next to us but they never come to find out what we are doing.
- 17) Izewlethu madam mayor. The idea is that we know for a fact that there are people who were pushed off their land in Tafelsig. These people are living in holes and yet the city has billions to spare while people are living in squalor. When you are mobilizing for elections you said that you would be looking into the issue of backyard dwellers. Some people are sleeping in toilets. Your visit to Ilitha Park – I did not know that you were coming and I live there. Why do you sneak in at night? Why do you not announce it? Come to Khayelitsha, announce your coming and we will be there in great numbers!

Patricia de Lille

The R1.2 billion is meant for indignant grants when people are not able to pay their electricity – then they apply for the grant and they are able to pay for their services. This is a service that we give to those who cannot afford to pay for their rates. This is besides the basic amount of water that everyone in Cape Town gets. Everyone in this city gets 350 liters of water free whether you are poor or rich. The same with free 50 kilowatts free of electricity.

I must say that we will never, ever go back to influx control. This is a free country – people can live and move and work where they want. Yes, we must have a policy for urbanization. The two cities in South Africa that have the biggest problem with urbanization are Cape Town and Johannesburg. We are constantly meeting and sharing ideas about how we can deal with these problems together. In the city, whatever we plan, through all our plans, urbanization is worked in there, integrated into our plans. People are moving to this city because they want their children to go to better schools and have better lives and we welcome that.

The negotiations and the strike that are going on. We fought in the struggle against apartheid for people to have the right to protest peacefully. We will respect the right of unions and any organizations to have the right to protest but we will condemn any violence, like that we saw today. I was out in the streets of Cape Town today. And many of the people who are there, like the flower sellers, their stuff was taken, stolen. This is wrong - they have the right to run a business. The wage negotiations are taking place at a national level at SALGA. I have made an appeal for the unions and SALGA to go back to the negotiation table.

You stopped short of fully quoting the deputy mayor's statement. Read the second part and it will answer you.

For healthcare, you are so right. Healthcare is an unfunded mandate for local government. And every year, we have to sign an intergovernmental relationship between the province and the city. The city puts in R354 million and the province puts in money. We are now finalizing the plan – either the city must take responsibility, or the province, but one of these two spheres of government must take responsibility for it and make it one health service. We are finalizing this before the next financial year – we are working with the MEC for Health on this issue.

Youth empowerment is important. The first program that we have is apprenticeship that we all know used to be there many years ago. We have linked up with colleges and in all our utility departments, like in water and electricity, we will take in students to do their apprenticeship to become plumbers or electricians. The city has opened our doors to train young people to become more empowered.

As for small businesses, I will give my card to that sister to look at your problem more directly.

All business opportunities, we are looking at how do we fight poverty, we need to roll back the frontiers of poverty like I said in my speech.

Racism is not only a Cape Town problem. It is with us from our past but to change this, and we need to start with ourselves. We need to listen to the vision of Mandela who said 'let us unite in our diversity'. Racism is terrible, our constitution outlaws racism and wherever you find it, report it to the Equality Court or any of the other mechanisms that we have in this country. Because we do need to address racism in a direct manner.

I did not say Cape Town is an equal city. I could never make a statement like that. Because South Africa is the most unequal country in the world, we have overtaken Brazil. But, what a UN Habitat survey showed, is that the three most unequal cities in the world are found in South Africa: Johannesburg, East London and Ekurhuleni. That is what the report is saying. When you take the baseline against which those other cities are measured, and you measure Cape Town, then you can see that we are doing far better than the other three.

Education is the key to the future for our children. Education is the highest national budget that we spend. The current national minister of basic education is starting to ask the correct questions – do we get value for money? Is there a need to relook at our outcomes? We can compare Westerford and other schools but a lot of people pay to have their children at those wealthy schools. What I want to know is why is it that we have the worst schools for poor people? Why cant we also bring the quality of education and teachers in poor schools than in poor areas? It does not mean that when you are poor that you should poor education.

Hangberg – I will give you my card afterwards. I want to show you an agreement that the people of Hangberg have signed. You must respect that the people of Hangberg together with the city and the province agreed on a mediator – you cannot have a mediator unless people agree. The court instructed us to have mediation and we are going back to court now with an agreement that came out of those negotiations. You are misleading the people if you say that the people of Hangberg are not going to have houses built there. There are going to be sea-facing houses. And very soon our

people are going to be living next to the sea without paying R1 million to do so. That is what will happen.

The land issue in Hangberg – we have transferred ownership of the houses that people have been living in for 62 years [someone shouts from the crowd ‘you gave them a letter’]. You don’t know what you are talking about. I have been to Hangberg and am engaging with Hangberg directly.

Tafelsig – it is before the court now and so I cannot comment now.

I did not sneak into Elitha Park, I was invited by SANCO. The ward councilor invited me and the ward councilor was there and we are working together. If you invite me to Khayelitsha and you want to meet with me, I will certainly come.